



Údarás Náisiúnta Iompair
National Transport Authority

Proposal to Directly Award a Public Bus Service Contract to Dublin Bus in 2019

2. Performance Report on Current
Dublin Bus Direct Award Contract

October 2018



Contents

<i>Executive Summary</i>	2
<i>1.0 Introduction</i>	5
1.1 Background	5
1.2 Dublin Bus	6
<i>2.0 The Contract with Dublin Bus</i>	7
2.1 The Contract	7
2.2 The scope of the PSO included in the Contract	7
2.3 The PSO services to be provided	7
2.4 Changes to the PSO Services	8
2.5 Performance Obligations	8
2.6 Measuring the Performance Obligations	15
2.7 Other Reporting Requirements	15
2.8 Monitoring the Contract	16
2.9 Fares	16
2.10 Capital Grants	16
<i>3.0 Operation of the Bus Services</i>	17
3.1 Overview	17
3.2 Reliability and Punctuality Results	17
3.3 Customer Information Results	18
3.4 Customer Experience Results	19
3.6 Environmental Performance	22
<i>4.0 Changes to the Contract</i>	23
4.1 Service changes	23
4.2 Fare Increases Approved	24
4.3 Purchase of buses and associated equipment and systems	24
<i>5.0 Audits of the Contract</i>	25
<i>Appendix A: Performance Obligation Results</i>	26

Executive Summary

Direct Award Contract

In December 2014, under the provisions of the Dublin Transport Authority Act 2008 as amended, the National Transport Authority [“the NTA”] entered into a direct award contract¹ [“the Contract”] with Dublin Bus for the provision of public service obligation [“PSO”] bus services in the Greater Dublin Area for a period of 5 years.

The Contract is due to expire in on 30th November 2019 and the NTA must decide whether to enter into a Direct Award Contract with Dublin Bus. The Act specifies that before a subsequent direct award can be entered into, the NTA must prepare and publish a report detailing the operation of the public bus services under the current direct award contract.

This report therefore considers the operation of the Contract and the services provided to the NTA between the period of Q1/2015 and Q4/2017, a total of 12 quarters.

Performance Obligations

The Contract sets out performance obligations within the following categories which Dublin Bus must comply with when providing the services:

1. Reliability and Punctuality Obligations
2. Service Quality, Customer Information and Customer Experience Obligations

Within the Contract the Reliability and Punctuality performance obligations have incentivised payment mechanisms. Ten per cent of the total compensation due is retained by the NTA on a quarterly basis and is only released on demonstrating compliance with these particular performance obligations. Dublin Bus is required to measure and report their compliance with the performance obligations at intervals specified in the Contract to the NTA. Since 2017 the NTA has commenced the measurement and reporting of certain performance obligations. The NTA and Dublin Bus meet on a 4 weekly basis and on a quarterly basis to review the performance obligation results and other reporting required under the Contract.

Contract performance monitoring and reporting requirements were significantly strengthened as part of the 2014-2019 direct award contract. These changes were phased in during 2017, with the performance requirements in the early stages of the contract broadly the same as in the previous direct award contract (2009-2014).

Details of contractual performance reporting requirements are set out in Section 2 of this report.

¹ A contract directly awarded to an Operator that is not subject to a competitive tendering process.

Services Provided, Compensation Paid and Performance Results

During the period 2015 to 2017 Dublin Bus provided, under the Contract, PSO services in the Greater Dublin area. In return for the provision of the services, the NTA compensated Dublin Bus with monies received from Exchequer funding.

Over the period, vehicle kilometres operated increased by 1% and passenger numbers increased by 14%. The compensation paid by the NTA to subsidise the operation of services has decreased by €3.7m or 6% between 2015 and 2017.

Overall, Dublin Bus reported a generally good level of compliance with the required performance obligations from 2015 to 2017.

PSO contract performance over the period 2015 to 2017 is set in more detail in Section 3 of this report.

Changes Approved to the PSO services

The Contract provides that any changes to the PSO services must be subject to the approval of the NTA. To date the NTA has approved a number of alterations to services during each year of the contract. Those with cost implications are summarised in Section 4 of this report.

Fares

The Contract provides that Dublin Bus retains the fares revenue. It also provides that the NTA must approve any fare alterations. Dublin Bus has complied with all the process requirements in relation to the approval of fares and the subsequent implementation of approved fares.

Purchase of buses and associated equipment and systems

The Contract provides for the granting of capital funds to Dublin Bus for the purchase of public transport infrastructure, primarily new vehicles, but also for the refurbishment of older vehicles, provision of accessibility measures in vehicles and integrated transport measures such as Real Time Passenger Information.

In 2017 the Authority revised the manner in which buses are provided to Dublin Bus, with vehicles now being purchased directly by the Authority before being provided to Dublin Bus to use on PSO services in this contract, under license.

Auditing the Contract

Each year the NTA has commissioned independent audits of Dublin Bus' financial systems, controls and processes to ensure:

- that Dublin Bus correctly allocates its costs and revenue between PSO and commercial activities.
- that any reasonable profit claimed for delivering PSO services had been calculated on an appropriate basis and that the operating costs incurred are consistent with those of a 'well run' transport operator

-
- that any financial flows between the CIE companies do not provide a cross-subsidy between the CIE companies.

The independent audit for 2015 concluded that overall there was “Substantial Assurance” in relation to the conduct of the contract. The audit for 2016 concluded that overall there was “Satisfactory Assurance”. At the time of writing, the audit for the 2017 contract year is underway.

1.0 Introduction

1.1 *Background*

In 2007 EU Regulation 1370/2007 – on public passenger transport services by rail and by road was adopted by the European Union. The Regulation sets out a requirement for Member States to provide public passenger transport services that are the subject of a public service obligation [‘PSO’] through a public service contract between a transport authority and a public transport operator.

In order to implement the Regulation into Irish law, the National Transport Authority [‘NTA’] was established by the Dublin Transport Authority Act 2008 and its powers extended by the Public Transport Regulation Act 2009 [‘the Acts’].

Under a public service contract, the Authority compensates the Operator with monies received from the Oireachtas in return for the provision of specified public passenger transport services.

The Acts required the Authority to enter into a direct award contract with Dublin Bus for the provision of public bus transport services in the greater Dublin Area for a period of 5 years commencing from 1st December 2009. In 2013, the National Transport Authority decided to award a further direct award contract to Dublin Bus for a period of five years from December 2014.

The 2014 direct award contract included a provision to remove approximately 10% of services in the contract and competitively tender them during the lifetime of the contract. A tender completion took place for the operation of services in the Outer Dublin Metropolitan Area (ODMA) and resulted in the award of a contract to Go Ahead Dublin, which is due to commence in late Q3 2018.

The direct award contract for the services remaining in the 2014 direct award contract is due to expire on 30th November 2019.

Before a subsequent direct award can be placed with Dublin Bus, the Acts set out various requirements that the Authority must comply with, one of which is the preparation and publication of a report setting out the operation of the public bus passenger services under the present direct award contract².

The purpose of this Report therefore is to fulfil this requirement. It provides an account of the operation of the public bus services provided by Dublin Bus under the Contract between the periods January 2015 and December 2017 – a total of twelve quarterly periods.

² Section 52 (6) (e) of the 2008 Act

Section 2 of this report provides an overview of the provisions of the Contract. Section 3 provides an account of the operation of the public bus services provided during this period.

1.2 Dublin Bus

Dublin Bus is a wholly owned subsidiary of Córas Iompar Éireann [CIE], a commercial state body which provides bus and rail public transport services. The Company was established in 1987 under the Transport [Re-organisation of CIE Act] 1986 and is the largest provider of PSO bus services in the Greater Dublin Area between the area between Newcastle in County Wicklow to the south, Balbriggan in north County Dublin and Maynooth in County Kildare to the west.

The Company currently employs in the order of 3,000 people and operates from 7 depots within the Greater Dublin Area. The PSO services comprise a network of cross city, radial, orbital, DART feeder, Xpresso and Nitelink services. The network was, as of Q4 2017, operated by 993 predominantly double deck buses. Over 90% of these are standard double deck buses, which can carry c. 90 seated and standing passengers. 70 of the double deck buses are larger tri-axle vehicles with a capacity of c. 120 passengers. The average age of the fleet is approximately 7 years with a range in ages from 14 to 0 years.

Under the Contract, Dublin Bus is responsible for the provision of bus depot and stabling facilities, supply and maintenance of bus fleet and ancillary facilities (such as ticket machines, automatic vehicle location equipment and CCTV equipment) and associated communications, storage, analysis and reporting systems. They are also responsible for the provision of staff and staff facilities and marketing.

In addition to, and financially separate from the PSO services provision, the Company also operates commercial activities such as the Airlink service, sight-seeing tours and private hire services.

2.0 The Contract with Dublin Bus

2.1 The Contract

The Contract between Dublin Bus and the NTA was signed on the 1st December 2014 for a period of 5 years. The main provisions of the Contract are set out in the following paragraphs.

2.2 *The scope of the PSO included in the Contract*

The Contract defines the scope of the PSO as including not only the transport services to be provided but also the wider attributes of an efficient and functional public transport network such as the provision of passenger information, ticketing, transport interchanges, participation in wider Integration projects such as integrated Ticketing [LEAP], Real time Passenger Information [RTPI] and website development [Journey Planning etc.].

2.3 The PSO services to be provided

The direct award Contract Service Specification provides a listing schedule of the PSO services to be provided by Dublin Bus. It sets out the stopping points and timetables or minimum service frequencies for each of the routes in the direct award contract. The Service Specification is available here: https://www.nationaltransport.ie/wp-content/uploads/2018/01/Dublin_Bus_Service_Specification.xlsx

As of December 2017, Dublin Bus operate 136 bus services under direct award contract with the National Transport Authority.

The network currently comprises 118 radial, orbital and local bus routes as well as 18 Nitelink routes (operating primarily on Friday and Saturday nights from 24:00 to 04:00 from the city centre to the suburbs).

Dublin Bus currently operate 13 high-frequency routes, i.e. routes operating 4 or more departures per hour in the inter-peak period. Most cross-city routes operate on a frequent day long basis, 7-days a week, with services every 15 minutes or more at peak times from Monday to Friday.

Express type services also operate on 13 routes, service customers during peak hours only.

Dublin Bus operate a number of orbital routes which generally run on an alignment around the suburbs and do not serve the city centre, include routes that form local networks around major centres of population other than the city centre. .

Nitelink routes operate primarily on Friday and Saturday nights from 24:00 to 04:00 from the city centre to the suburbs.

In order to ensure that the specified services provide adequate passenger capacity Schedule A also specifies both the number of vehicles to be deployed at peak periods [peak vehicle requirement – ‘PVR’] and the frequency at which they are to operate.

2.4 Changes to the PSO Services

The 2014 direct award contract provides that any changes to the PSO services are subject to the approval of the NTA. It also provides for the Authority to compensate Dublin Bus for changes in operating costs associated with service changes, at the rates set out in the contract.

2.5 Performance Obligations

The 2014 direct award contract included major revision of performance obligations and reporting requirements. The contract recognised that an interim period would need to apply while Dublin Bus updated its reporting requirements to meet contractual obligations. In the interim, the 2009 direct award contract performance obligations continued to apply.

The 2009 contract sets out, in Schedule B, minimum performance requirements that must be met by Dublin Bus when providing the PSO services. These comprise a series of performance obligations within 5 categories that measure Dublin Bus’s performance in providing the services. The categories are as follows:

- 1. Reliability and Punctuality Obligations** – 8 no. obligations to ensure that the bus services operate reliably and punctually with sufficient capacity, frequency and provide adequate coverage of the network to cater for customer demand. The Contract incentivises the Reliability and Punctuality [with the exception of the Vehicles in Service-Valley Period] performance obligations. Ten per cent of the total annual Compensation due is retained by the NTA on a quarterly basis and is paid to Dublin Bus when it is demonstrated that the performance obligations have been achieved for that Quarter. Failure to meet any of the performance obligation targets will result in the deduction by the NTA of an equivalent proportion of the retained compensation due.
- 2. Customer information Obligations** – 8 no. obligations to ensure that sufficient information is made available to the customer in order to use the services;
- 3. Customer experience Obligations** – 4 no. obligations to ensure that the customer experience when using the services is satisfactory;
- 4. Efficiency Targets**- 2 no. obligations to ensure that efficiencies are delivered by Dublin Bus in relation to the implementation of the Cost and Efficiency Reviews and Revenue Protection;
- 5. Environmental Obligation** - Compliance with vehicle emission and noise targets and reporting on the progress achieved on use of bio-fuels.

The NTA conducts a quarterly review of the performance obligation results with the objective of continuous improvement of the delivery and efficiencies of the PSO services.

The performance obligations inherited from the 2009 contract and in place up to 2017 are set out in Table 1.

Performance obligation		Description	Compliance Test	Reporting Frequency	Major Amendments since 2014
Reliability Obligations					
1. Vehicles in Service					
1.1	Weekday AM Peak	Percentage of pvr that must be in service at specified periods.	Minimum of 98%	Quarterly	2017 - Replaced with scheduled kilometres operated by route from Automatic Vehicle Location data
1.2	Weekday PM Peak		Minimum of 98%		
1.3	Saturday Peak		Minimum of 98%		
1.4	Sunday Peak		Minimum of 98%		
2. Driver Duties					
2	Drivers' Duties Operated	Percentage of drivers' duties to be operated.	Minimum of 98%	Quarterly	2017- Replaced with scheduled kilometres operated by route from Automatic Vehicle Location data
3. Scheduled Km Operated					
3	Schedule Km Operated	Percentage of Schedule Km operated.	Minimum of 95%	Quarterly / Periodic from P5 2017	2017- Criteria aggregated network-wide and % of scheduled kilometres operated (excluding third-party causes for non-operation) calculated utilising AVL data from P5.
4. Services Operated					
4	Services Operated	Percentage of Services operated.	Minimum of 97%	Quarterly	2017-Obligation discontinued in P5in P5
Punctuality Obligation					
5	Punctuality	Percentage of services departing within 5 minutes of the scheduled time	95%	Quarterly	2017 – Obligation discontinued upon activation of low-frequency punctuality obligation in P5.

Performance obligation		Description	Compliance Test	Reporting Frequency	Major Amendments since 2014
Provision of Customer Information Obligations					
6	Timetable Information	Availability of correct and up to date timetable information on website	Confirmation of Availability	Quarterly	
7	Bus Destination Scrolls	Percentage of vehicles displaying correct destination information	Minimum of 98%	Quarterly	
8	Customer Telephone Information	Opening hours of telephone information line and percentage of calls answered in specified time	Minimum of 90% calls answered in 60 seconds	Quarterly	
9	24 Service Information	Availability of information on 24 hour basis by web or text	Confirmation of Availability	Quarterly	
10	On-Street Information	Provision of correct and up to date timetable information at bus stops that provide information	Minimum of 98% accurate timetables displayed	Quarterly	
11	Complaint Recording	Recording of complaints received by category	n/a	Quarterly	
12	Fares Information	Up to date information available on website, any changes to be published not less than 5 working days in advance	Availability of information and minimum 5 days in advance of changes	Quarterly	
13	Network Changes on Website	Comprehensive and up to date information to be available on the website, changes to be published not less than 5 working days in advance	Confirmation of Availability and Minimum 5 days in advance	Quarterly	
Customer Experience Obligations					
14	Cleanliness	Cleanliness of vehicles and public areas of Company premises	Percentage of Compliance	Quarterly	
15	Staff	Staff to be friendly, helpful, courteous and well presented at all	n/a	Quarterly	

Performance obligation		Description	Compliance Test	Reporting Frequency	Major Amendments since 2014
		times			
16	Accessibility	All new vehicles to be low floor, wheel chair accessible	All buses	Annual	
17	Bus Fleet Age	Report the average age of the fleet	Full Fleet	Annual	
Efficiency Obligations					
18	Cost & Efficiency Review	Implementation of the findings of the cost and efficiency review [Network Direct]	Implemented as planned	Quarterly	
19	Revenue Protection	Report on measures to ensure revenue protection	Percentage of Compliance	Quarterly	
Environmental Obligations					
20	Emission Compliance	Compliance with noise and emission standards and reporting on bio-fuel targets		Annual	

Table 1: Summary of Performance Obligations (taken from 2009 contract and applied to 2014 contract on interim basis up to 2017 / 2018)

The performance obligations set out in the 2014 contract and applicable from 2017/2018 to expiry date of the 2014 contract are set out in Table 2.

Performance obligation		Description	Current Compliance Test	Current Reporting Frequency and Method	Major Amendments since 2014
1. Reliability Obligations					
1.1	Scheduled KMs Operated	Evidence that target percentage of scheduled revenue earning Km operated.	Minimum 95%	Periodic reporting from DMS	2017- % of scheduled kilometres operated (excluding third-party causes for non-operation) calculated utilising AVL data from P5.
2. Punctuality					
2.1	Low-Frequency Services	Percentage of low frequency services departing any bus stop on route within -1 to +6 minutes of timetabled time.	Target varies seasonally and will increase year-on-year	Periodic reporting from DMS	2017 - Active since Period 5
2.2	High-Frequency Services	Specified percentage of services to operate from the terminus no later than 5 minutes after scheduled time	Minimum 95%	Quarterly reporting from Operator	2017 – Obligation limited to high-frequency services upon activation of low-frequency punctuality obligation (2.1).
3. Service Quality Performance					
3.1	RTPI Data Performance	Provision of Operator data to support provision of accurate real-time information by authority	100% deduction: 4 or more performance points. 50% deduction: 2 to 3 performance points	Periodic Operator reports and Authority surveys and audits of Apps, website and stops.	
3.2	Leap Card Scheme Performance	Provision of required Leap Card data to Authority	100% deduction:	Authority	

Performance obligation		Description	Current Compliance Test	Current Reporting Frequency and Method	Major Amendments since 2014
			15 or more performance points. 50% deduction: 8 to 14 performance points	to record instances of failure each Quarter	
3.3	Journey Planner Data Performance	Provision of required data to support provision of National Journey Planner by the Authority	100% deduction: 3 or more performance points. 50% deduction: 1 to 2 performance points	Authority to record instances of failure each Quarter	
3.4	Bus Vehicle Performance	Network Bus is operated in accordance with Network Bus Specification set out in Schedule 3	100% deduction: more than 12 performance points. 50% deduction: more than 6 and up to 12 performance points	Quarterly NTA Mystery Shopper surveys	
3.5	Bus Equipment Performance	Equipment on-board meets the Network Bus Specification in Schedule 3 and is functioning and in use.	100% deduction: more than 72 performance points. 50% deduction: more than 36 and up to 72 performance points	Quarterly NTA Mystery Shopper surveys	
3.6	Bus Driver Performance	Performance of Bus driver in terms of appearance, interaction with customers and driving style	100% deduction: more than 34 performance points. 50% deduction: more than 17 and up to 34 performance points	Quarterly NTA Mystery Shopper surveys	

Performance obligation		Description	Current Compliance Test	Current Reporting Frequency and Method	Major Amendments since 2014
3.7	Cleanliness Performance	Bus cleanliness and Station Cleanliness	100% deduction: more than 24 performance points. 50% deduction: more than 12 and up to 24 performance points	Quarterly NTA Mystery Shopper surveys	
3.8	Customer Service Performance	Customer service desk opening hours, Service Centre opening hours, complaints acknowledgement response times, substantive response times, Service centre automated answer, Service centre person answer, lost property office opening hours	100% deduction: more than 20 performance points. 50% deduction: more than 10 and up to 20 performance points	Quarterly Operator reports	
3.9	Customer Information Performance	Bus fares, customer information at stops, bus stop database maintenance, Operator website and App, Operator website availability, advance announcement of timetable changes, advance announcement of fares changes	100% deduction: more than 12 performance points. 50% deduction: more than 6 and up to 12 performance points	Combination of Quarterly Operator Reports and NTA Mystery Shopper surveys	
3.10	Stop Maintenance Performance	Maintenance of bus stop poles and flags, stop cleanliness, stop advertising	100% deduction: more than 12 performance points. 50% deduction: more than 6 and up to 12 performance points	Combination of Quarterly Operator Reports and NTA Mystery Shopper surveys	

Performance obligation		Description	Current Compliance Test	Current Reporting Frequency and Method	Major Amendments since 2014
3.11	Report Provision Performance	Provision of Operator Periodic, Quarterly and Annual reports within stipulated timeframes	100% deduction: more than 4 performance points. 50% deduction: 2 to 4 performance points	Authority to record report provision each Quarter	

Table 2: Summary of Performance Obligations (applicable since 2017)

2.6 Measuring the Performance Obligations

From 2014 to early 2017 the reliability and punctuality of services was reported to the Authority by Dublin Bus, based on a sample of departure times recorded at bus termini. Since 2017, the reliability and punctuality of Dublin Bus operations has been measured using an Automatic Vehicle Location and Control system fitted to each Dublin Bus bus. This constantly records the position of the vehicle. The bus departure times from each bus stop are compared to the scheduled departure times. The system is also used to provide Real Time Passenger Information [RTPI] to passengers.

From 2014 to end 2016 the Customer Experience and Customer Information performance obligations were reported to the NTA by Dublin Bus, who employed independent consultants to undertake 'mystery shoppers' market research firms to provide verification that the performance obligations are being met. Since 2017, this obligation has been replaced by various Customer Service Quality performance obligations, which are measured by a combination of NTA commissioned mystery shop surveys and Dublin Bus reports.

2.7 Other Reporting Requirements

Schedule 18 of the Contract imposes reporting obligations in relation to the provision of information in relation to the operation of the PSO network. Additional information required to be reported is as follows:

1. Passenger Journeys
2. Payments Received
3. Costs Incurred
4. Capital Expenditure
5. Staff numbers

6. Network Operations (accidents occurred, environmental reports, fleet age etc.)

2.8 Monitoring the Contract

Periodic and Quarterly Review meetings are held between NTA and Dublin Bus to review Schedule 18 report results. The NTA publishes contractual performance results on www.nationaltransport.ie on a quarterly basis. Financial reporting is not published as it contains commercially sensitive information.

In addition the NTA has commissioned independent audits of Dublin Bus' financial allocation systems and processes in relation to the operation of the Contract on an annual basis.

2.9 Fares

The Contract is a 'net cost contract' - under which Dublin Bus collects and retains the passenger fares. The Contract provides that Dublin Bus must obtain approval from the NTA in relation to any proposed change in fares.

2.10 Capital Grants

The Authority, subject to certain conditions, may award capital grant funding to Dublin Bus. Such grants may cover the acquisition of new public service vehicles.

3.0 Operation of the Bus Services

3.1 Overview

During the period 2015 to 2017 Dublin Bus provided, under the Contract, PSO services in the Greater Dublin region. In return for the provision of the services, the NTA compensated Dublin Bus with monies received from Exchequer funding.

Over the period, vehicle kilometres operated increased by 1% and passenger numbers increased by 14%. The compensation paid by the NTA to subsidise the operation of services has decreased by €3.7m or 6% between 2015 and 2017. The cost per kilometre operated increased by €0.24 or 5%.

Table 3 provides an overview of the PSO services provided by Dublin Bus, passengers carried and costs and revenue associated with the provision of the PSO services.

Year	Total Scheduled Vehicle Km ³ [Millions]	Passengers Carried [Million]	Revenue Collected [Million]	Cost of Operations [Million]	Cost/km	Compensation Paid [Million]
2015	47.44	119.82	€205.66	€265.61	€5.59	€57.70
2016	47.14	125.35	€212.08	€276.92	€5.87	€59.56
2017	47.60	136.26	€225.3	€281.37	€5.91	€53.96

Table 3: Bus Operations Overview

3.2 Reliability and Punctuality Results

Based on information provided by Dublin Bus, a good level of compliance was achieved in the period 2015 to 2017 against the KPIs for punctuality and reliability that were inherited from the 2009 direct award contract. Details are set out in Table 4 below and in Tables A1 to A7 in Appendix A.

³ Total Vehicle KMs operated – PSO routes only

Performance Obligation		Target	2015 Average	2016 Average	2017 Average	Running Average	No. of Non Compliances Reported	See Table No
Vehicles in Services								
1.1	Weekday AM	98%	100%	100%	100%	100%	0/10	A1
1.2	Weekday PM	98%	99%	98%	99%	99%	1/10	
1.3	Saturday Peak	98%	98%	97%	98%	98%	6/10	
1.4	Sunday Peak	98%	100%	100%	100%	100%	0/10	
Driver Duties Operated								
2	Drivers Duties Operated	98%	99%	99%	100%	99%	1/10	A2
Scheduled Kms Operated								
3	Total	97%	98%	98%	98%	98%	0/10	A3
Services Operated								
4	Total	95%	96%	95%	96%	96%	2/10	A4
Scheduled Kilometres Operated <i>Based on AVL data</i>								
5.1	Total	95%	N/A	N/A	96%	96%	0/9	A5
Punctuality <i>High and low frequency punctuality at origin terminus – sample of services recorded for Dublin Bus</i>								
6.1	Total	95%	95.6%	96.4%	97.1%	96.4%	1/12	A6
Low-Frequency Punctuality 2017 only, over full route, based on AVL data supplied to NTA by Dublin Bus)								
7.1	Total	56% to 61%	N/A	N/A	58% to 65%	58% to 65%	1/9	A7
Total							11/100	

Table 4: Reliability and Punctuality Results

3.3 Customer Information Results

The customer information results for 2015 and 2016 are taken from Dublin Bus commissioned mystery shop surveys. The results for 2017 are taken from NTA commissioned mystery shop surveys, which used a revised methodology and categorisation for assessing measuring performance.

Within this category, a total of 6 non-compliances were reported.

There was a high level of non-compliance in relation to network changes and up-to-date timetable information on the Dublin Bus website.

Details are set out in Table 5, and in Tables A8 to A14 in Appendix A.

Performance Obligation		Compliance Test	2015 Average	2016 Average	2017 Average	Running Average	No. of Non Compliances Recorded	Refer to Table
8.0	Timetable Information	100%	100%	100%	N/A	100%	0/8	Table A8
9.0	Bus Destination Scrolls	98%	99.6%	98.1%	N/A	98.9%	0/8	Table A9
10.0	Customer Telephone Information	90%	96.0%	99.6%%	N/A	97.8%	0/8	Table A10
11.0	On-Street Information	98%	99.8%	99.6%	N/A	99.7%	0/8	Table A11
12.0	24 Hours Service Information	<i>Availability of Information</i>	98.8%	100%	N/A	99.4%	2/8	Table A12
13.0	Fares Information	<i>Availability of Information</i>	100%	100%	N/A	100%	0/8	Table A13
14.0	Network Changes on Website	<i>Availability of Information</i>	90.3%	87.3%	N/A	88.8%	4/8	Table A14
Total							6/56	

Table 5: Customer Information Results

3.4 Customer Experience Results

Stations, drivers and vehicles

The customer experience results for 2015 and 2016 are taken from Dublin Bus commissioned mystery shop surveys. The results for 2017 are taken from NTA commissioned mystery shop surveys, which used a revised methodology and categorisation for assessing measuring performance.

The 2015 and 2016 results are presented in Table 6 and in Table A15 of Appendix A. These indicators were not part of the contractual performance regime at the time, so there are no recorded non-compliances.

Reporting obligation		Compliance Test	2015 Average	2016 Average	No. of non-compliances reported	Refer to Table
15.1	Bus vacuumed and washed each day	N/A	99.8%	87%	N/A	A15
15.2	Day removal of rubbish, emptying of bins and attending to soiling of significant nature	N/A	99.8%	99.7%	N/A	A15
15.3	Bus valeted every 4 weeks	N/A	99.9%	100%	N/A	A15
15.4	BAC to keep public areas of BAC buildings clean	N/A	100%	99.7%	N/A	A15
15.5	BE drivers are well-presented, friendly, helpful and courteous	N/A	97.6%	97.3%	N/A	A15

Table 6: Customer Experience performance (2015 and 2016)

The 2017 results are presented in Table 7 and in Table A16 of Appendix A. The application of service quality performance targets based on the results of quarterly NTA commissioned Mystery Shops commenced in Q1 2017. A total of 12 of 20 performance targets were not met in 2017. Where targets were not met, contractual performance payment deductions were applied.

Target	Year	Performance target met?	Refer to table
<i>Bus Equipment Performance (including heating, lighting, wheelchair ramps, CCTV, ticket machine, route and destination displays)</i>	2017	2 of 4 quarters	A16
<i>Bus Driver Performance (helpful, polite, drives smoothly, pulls into kerb at stop, stops at bus stops on request, informs of disruption)</i>	2017	4 of 4 quarters	A16
<i>Customer Information Performance (fares display on buses, information at bus stops)</i>	2017	4 of 4 quarters	A18
<i>Customer care performance (customer service desk, complaints response times, etc)</i>	2017	4 of 4 quarters	A16
<i>Cleanliness Performance (bus vehicles and stations)</i>	2017	4 of 4 quarters	A16
<i>Stop Maintenance Performance (Stop repairs, cleaning and being kept free of advertising)</i>	2017	4 of 4 quarters	A16

Table 7: Customer Experience performance (2017)

Complaint rates

The overall complaint rate reduced from early 2017 onwards, with a slight increase in overall complaint rate at the end of 2017, largely as a result of capacity issues on certain routes. A summary is provided in Table 8 and in more detail in Table A17 of Appendix A.

Complaints (Per 100,000 Passengers)	2015				2016				2017				Refer to Table
	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	
Total Figure Achieved	15.9	11.4	12.2	11.6	15.4	17.1	15.8	17.0	11.8	10.2	10.0	12.3	A17

Table 7: Customer Experience performance (2017)

Vehicle accessibility and age

These obligations are reported to the Authority by Dublin Bus on a quarterly basis. The results are summarised in Table 8.

Performance obligation		Compliance Test	2015 Average	2016 Average	2017 Average	Running Average	No. of non-compliances reported
14.0	Accessibility	All new Vehicles purchased to be wheelchair accessible	100%	100%	N/A	100%	0
15.0	Fleet Bus Age	Report Bus Fleet Age	7.5 years	6.5 years	6.2 years	N/A	0
Total							0

Table 8: Vehicle accessibility and age

3.6 Environmental Performance

BÉ has reported full compliance with emissions and noise vehicle standards. From Q4 2016 onwards, Dublin Bus has also reported on a quarterly basis in relation to fuel consumption and carbon emissions, and complaints made in relation to noise and vibration associated with its PSO operations.

4.0 Changes to the Contract

4.1 Service changes

The Contract provides that any changes to the PSO services must be subject to the approval of the NTA. The NTA has approved a number of alterations to services during each year of the contract to date. Those with cost implications are summarised below. In addition there have been numerous minor timetable adjustments and stopping locations relocations with no cost implications.

- 2015 – 24 route or timetable changes with an annualised gross cost of €468,245.00
 - Route 4
 - Routes 31, 31A, 31B, 32

- 2016 – 25 route or timetable changes with an annualised gross cost of €4,444,517.00
 - Route 1
 - Route 4
 - Route 9
 - Route 15
 - Routes 25A, 25B and 25X
 - Route 27B
 - Route 67
 - Routes 31A, 31B, 31C and 32
 - Routes 38A, 38B and 70
 - Route 40
 - Route 42D
 - Route 68X
 - Route 70D
 - Route 84X
 - Route 140

- 2017 – 64 route or timetable changes with an annualised gross cost of €3,510,306.00
 - Route 1
 - Route 75
 - Route 17A
 - Route 142
 - Route 15
 - Routes 25A, 25B and 25D
 - Route 44
 - Route 53
 - Route 118
 - Route 84X

-
- Route 145
 - Route 39X
 - Route 9
 - Route
 - Route 46A
 - Route 140
 - Route 66
 - Route 26

These service changes have delivered improved public transport services for the public during the period of the Contract.

4.2 Fare Increases Approved

The Authority approved fares increases requested by Dublin Bus. The appropriate information was provided by Dublin Bus and the approvals were fully implemented.

4.3 Purchase of buses and associated equipment and systems

The Authority provided a capital grant to Dublin Bus in 2015 and in 2016 to fund the purchase of 90 and 110 urban double deck buses respectively for use on PSO services.

From 2017 the Authority has directly purchased buses and provided them to operators for use on PSO services contracted by the Authority.

A total of 100 urban double deck buses and 2 urban single deck buses were provided by the Authority to Dublin Bus in 2017.

The 2018 bus replacement programme is ongoing.

All fleet are Wi-Fi enabled, wheelchair accessible and meet modern EU emission standards.

In addition, the Authority invested in the period 2015-2017 in the provision of various enhancements to bus equipment and systems including Automatic Vehicle Location system enhancements and new ticketing equipment. The Authority has also funded upgrades to customer contact management system and additional resources for customer care and operational control of PSO bus services. The cost of certain of these items, including on-going operational costs of system enhancements required to support contract operations, are included in the annual subvention amounts set out in Table 3 above.

5.0 Audits of the Contract

The annual audit for the December 2014 contract commissioned by the NTA examines the financial systems, controls and processes used in relation to:

- Safety Management
- Environmental Management
- Ticketing and Fares Collection
- Operation and Maintenance of Network Assets
- Management of Security
- Records and Reporting Requirements
- Net Financial Report and Efficiency Incentive
- Defects and Damage to the Network Assets
- Insurance
- Other audit items

The audit for 2016 provided an overall assurance rating of “substantial”.

The audit for 2016 provided an overall assurance rating of “satisfactory”.

At the time of writing the 2017 audit is underway.

Appendix A: Performance Obligation Results

RELIABILITY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS

Vehicles in service			2015				2016				2017			
Ref	Time period	Target	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4
1.1	Weekday AM	98%	99.4%	99.3%	99.6%	99.5%	99.6%	99.6%	99.5%	99.6%	99.8%	99.8%	99.8%	99.8%
1.2	Weekday PM	98%	98.9%	98.5%	98.7%	98.8%	99.2%	98.3%	97.5%	98.3%	99.1%	99.1%	98.6%	98.9%
1.3	Saturday	98%	98.6%	97.6%	96.6%	98.6%	98.9%	96.3%	94.8%	96.9%	98.5%	98.3%	97.5%	98.8%
1.4	Peak Sunday Peak	98%	99.9%	100%	99.9%	100%	100%	100%	99.9%	99.9%	100%	100%	100%	99.8%

Table A1- Vehicles in Service as percent of Peak Vehicle Requirement (reported by Dublin Bus)

No	Performance Obligation		2015				2016				2017			
		Target	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4
Drivers Duties Operated – Total														
3.1		98%	99.3%	99.1%	99.3%	95.0%	99.5%	99.5%	98.7%	99.3%	99.5%	99.5%	99.3%	99.5%

Table A2- Drivers Duties Operated (reported by Dublin Bus)

No	Performance Obligation		2015				2016				2017			
		Target	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4
Scheduled Km Operated – Total														
3.1		97%	98.4%	98.4%	98.2%	98.0%	98.4%	97.9%	97.4%	97.2%	98.4%	98.5%	N/A	N/A

Table A3- Scheduled Kms Operated (reported by Dublin Bus)

No	Performance Obligation		2015				2016				2017			
		Target	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4
Services Operated – Total														
4.1		95%	96.5%	95.4%	96.2%	95.0%	96.2%	95.9%	94.5%	94.7%	96.2%	96.3%	N/A	N/A

Table A4- Services Operated (reported by Dublin Bus)

No	Performance Obligation		2017								
		Target	P5	P6	P7	P8	P9	P10	P11	P12	P13
Scheduled Kilometres Operated – Total											
5.1	Percentage of scheduled kilometres Percentage of scheduled kilometres operated (excludes third party causes for non-operation)	95%	95.3%	95.6%	96.1%	95.9%	95.8%	95.2%	95.4%	95.7%	95.3%

Table A5 – Scheduled Kilometres Operated as Per DMS

PUNCTUALITY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS

No	Performance Obligation		2015				2016				2017			
	Services leaving terminus within target margin of timetabled departure time	Target	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4
6.1	Total	95%	97%	96%	97%	98%	97%	97%	97%	96%	95%	95%	97%	96%

Table A6: Punctuality (Dublin Bus reports for sample of routes)

No	Performance Obligation		2017									
		Target	P5	P6	P7	P8	P9	P10	P11	P12	P13	
Punctuality of Low-Frequency Routes												
7.1	Percentage of low frequency services departing any bus stop on route within -1 to +6 minutes of timetabled time.	58% 61% 56%	58%	60%	61%	65%	64%	60%	61%	59%	57%	

Table A7: Punctuality (low frequency services (less than 4 per hour) measured at each bus stop where Dublin Bus AVL data is available)

CUSTOMER SERVICE QUALITY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS

Target	Year	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4
<i>Comprehensive and up to date timetable will be published on Dublin Bus website Supported by production of appropriate local timetable and media</i>	2015	Confirmed	Confirmed	Confirmed	Confirmed
	2016	Confirmed	Confirmed	Confirmed	Confirmed

Table A8: Timetabled Information (Dublin Bus commissioned mystery shop)

Target	Year	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Year Average
98%	2015	99.6%	99.8%	99.2%	99.5%	99.6%
98%	2016	99.7%	99.8%	99.4%	99.6%	99.6%

Table A9: Bus Destination Scrolls (Dublin Bus commissioned mystery shop)

Target	Year	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Year Average
<i>90% of calls answered in 60 seconds</i>	2015	95.2%	97.0%	96.7%	97.0%	96.0%
	2016	97.9%	98.0%	98.1%	97.6%	97.8%

Table A10: Customer Telephone Information (Dublin Bus commissioned mystery shop)

Target	Year	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Year Average
<i>Correct and up-to-date timetables on at least 98% of bus stops that provide information</i>	2015	100%	99.0%	99.6%	100%	99.8%
	2016	100%	100%	99.2%	99.4%	99.6%

Table A11: On Street Information (Dublin Bus commissioned mystery shop)

Target	Year	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Year Average
<i>Available 24 Hours a Day</i>	2015	100%	96.7%	100%	98.7%	98.8%
	2016	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%

Table A12: 24 Hour Service Information (Dublin Bus commissioned mystery shop)

Target	Year	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4
<i>Up-to-date fares information for all fares categories and all services to be available on BAC website. Fare changes to be on website as early as possible and not less than 10 days in advance of the change taking place</i>	2015	Confirmed	Confirmed	Confirmed	Confirmed
	2016	Confirmed	Confirmed	Confirmed	Confirmed

Table A13: Fares Information(Dublin Bus commissioned mystery shop)

Target	Year	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4
<i>Comprehensive and up to date timetable will be published on Dublin Bus website. Timetable changes to be announced on the website as early as possible and not less than 10 days in advance of the change taking place</i>	2015	100%	75%	100%	86%
	2016	66.0%	100%	100%	83.3%

Table A14: Network Changes on Website (Dublin Bus commissioned mystery shop)

Target	Year	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4
<i>Each bus operated in service will be vacuumed internally and washed externally each day</i>	2015	100%	100%	100%	99.0%
	2016	100%	98.3%	100%	99.6%
<i>Each bus will receive daily attention to include the removal of rubbish, emptying of bins and attending to visible or identifiable soiling of a significant nature</i>	2015	99.6%	99.6%	100%	100%
	2016	99.6%	99.2%	100%	99.9%
<i>Each bus will internally valeted on average every 4 weeks to include cleaning of all internal surfaces including windows, graffiti and stain removal</i>	2015	100%	99.5%	100%	100%
	2016	100%	100%	100%	100%
<i>BAC will keep the public areas of BAC buildings clean</i>	2015	100%	100%	100%	100%
	2016	100%	98.9%	100%	100%
<i>BE drivers are well-presented, friendly, helpful and courteous</i>	2015	97.9%	97.5%	97.6%	97.5%
	2016	96%	97.3%	97.5%	98.4%

Table A15: Customer experience performance (Dublin Bus commissioned mystery shop)

Target	Year	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4
<i>Bus Vehicle Performance (external branding and livery, specified vehicle capacity for route and time, age, correct number of doors)</i>	2017	Target Not Met 100% Deduction	Target Not Met 50% Deduction	Target Met	Target Met
<i>Bus Equipment Performance (including heating, lighting, wheelchair ramps, CCTV, ticket machine, route and destination displays)</i>	2017	Target Not Met 50% Deduction	Target Met	Target Met	Target Not Met 50% Deduction
<i>Bus Driver Performance (helpful, polite, drives smoothly, pulls into kerb at stop, stops at bus stops on request, informs of disruption)</i>	2017	Target Met	Target Met	Target Met	Target Met
<i>Customer Information Performance (fares display on buses, information at bus stops)</i>	2017	Target Met	Target Met	Target Met	Target Met
<i>Customer care performance (customer service desk, complaints response times, etc)</i>	2017	Target Met	Target Met	Target Met	Target Met
<i>Cleanliness Performance (bus vehicles)</i>	2017	Target Met	Target Met	Target Met	Target Met
<i>Stop Maintenance Performance (Stop repairs, cleaning and being kept free of advertising)</i>	2017	Target Met	Target Met	Target Met	Target Met

Table A16: Customer Service Quality Performance (NTA commissioned mystery shop)

Complaints (Per 100,000 Passengers)	2015				2016				2017			
	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4
Service Issues	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	7.2	5.8	5.1	4.5	6.7
Staff Issues	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	3.2	3.0	2.8	2.9	3.0
Boarding & Onboard	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	2.1	1.2	0.8	0.7	0.9
Fares & Ticketing	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	1.3	0.5	0.5	0.4	0.4
Timetabling / Service Changes	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	1.2	0.5	0.4	0.4	0.7
Customer Service	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	0.7	0.2	0.1	0.3	0.1
Anti-Social Behaviour	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	0.2	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.2
RTPI Issues	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1
Stop / Shelter Issues	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	0.4	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1
Environmental	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Website	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	0.1	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Apps	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	0.1	0.0	0.1	0.0	0.1
Total Figure Achieved	15.9	11.4	12.2	11.6	15.4	17.1	15.8	17.0	11.8	10.2	10.0	12.3

Table A17: Customer complaint rates (reported by Dublin Bus)